

Multi-State Locomotive Procurement

Request for Proposal 14-1-DPIT

Final Offer Evaluation Report

December 18, 2013

For the

Illinois Department of Transportation,

California Department of Transportation,

and the

Washington State Department of Transportation

Prepared by:

**Dante Watson, Solicitation Contact
Illinois Department of Transportation
2300 S. Dirksen Parkway
Springfield, Illinois**

A. Background

The purpose of RFP 14-1-DPIT is for the Illinois Department of Transportation (IDOT), as the lead agency under a joint procurement with the California Department of Transportation (Caltrans) and the Washington State Department of Transportation (WSDOT) to solicit Offers from locomotive manufacturers to build 32 to 35 new passenger locomotives. Services that the vendor will provide under this procurement will include: engineering, design, production, assembly, inspection, testing, delivery, and warranty services. IDOT is representing the Midwest Coalition, which is composed of the States of Illinois, Michigan, and Missouri. IDOT will purchase 21 locomotives, Caltrans will purchase 6 locomotives, and WSDOT will purchase between 5 and 8 locomotives. The procurement includes options for 225 additional locomotives, including a long-distance variant of the base locomotive. The contract requires that the last locomotive of the base order be delivered, accepted by IDOT/CALTRANS/WSDOT, and invoiced by the contractor for payment by no later than June 2017. The contract is funded by both the Federal Railroad Administration (FRA) grant funds and the State of California Proposition 1B bond funds.

The RFP required that proposals be submitted using a multi-packet procedure, with each Offeror's Price Offer Packet (Packet 2) sealed separately from Packets 1 (Technical Proposal), 3 (administrative elements), and 4 (Small Business Enterprise Plan). If an Offer passed all minimum qualifications and pass/fail elements, then the Technical Proposal and other scored elements were evaluated. The Evaluation Committee did a preliminary individual scoring followed by a consensus scoring. All proposals passed minimum qualifications and pass/fail requirements and scored at least the minimum of 80% of the Responsiveness points to qualify for having their Price Offers opened. Responsiveness elements were weighted 70% and the Pricing Offer was weighted 30% of the of the total evaluation points. Final selection was determined based on the highest points score resulting from the sum of Responsiveness elements points and the Price Offer points.

B. Summary of Evaluation

Three (3) Final Offers were received by November 27, 2013. The Final Offers were evaluated by the Evaluation Committee between December 10, 2013 and December 17, 2013.

Responsiveness Point scores were computed for all three Final Offers. All three (3) Offers were eligible for Price Offer opening. Offer Packet 2, "Price Offers," were sealed separately from the other Offer Packets. The Price Offers were opened and read on December 12, 2013 by Solicitation Contact Dante Watson. The Evaluation Committee then evaluated and scored the

Price Offers. Price Offer scores were combined with Responsiveness scores to determine the Total Offer Score and Proposed Awardee.

C. Minimum Qualifications and Technical Proposal Score

Three (3) Final Offers were received from the following Offerors:

- EMD
- Siemens
- MotivePower, Inc.

To qualify to have a Price Offer opened, each Offeror must satisfy all Minimum Qualifications (RFP Section B.9), Pass/Fail items (RFP Section B.10), and score 80% (56 points) or more of the Responsiveness Points (RFP Section B.4). The following table summarizes the evaluation of each Final Offer and shows whether or not the Final Offers met the Price Offer opening criteria. Please note that all three Final Offers met the Price Offer opening criteria.

Table 1 – Overview of Price Offer Opening Criteria

Offeror	Minimum Qualifications	Pass/Fail	Responsiveness Points (56 points or more)	Meets Price Offer Opening Criteria?
EMD	Met	Pass	58.11	Yes
Siemens	Met	Pass	64.42	Yes
MotivePower	Met	Pass	58.38	Yes

D. Price Offer Scores

The Price Offers were opened on December 12, 2013. The Offerors’ final Pricing Schedules (RFP Section 2.1) were checked for accuracy of mathematical calculations and adherence to the Price format per the RFP and addenda.

A total of 30 points was available for the Price Offer, with 25 points for Base Contract price, 3 points for Option Contract price, and 2 points for Life Cycle Cost. IDOT/Caltrans determined price points for the Base Contract Price, Option Contract Price, and Life Cycle Cost using the following formula (from RFP Section B.5):

$$\text{Maximum Price Points} \times (\text{Lowest Price or Cost} / \text{Offeror's Price or Cost}) = \text{Total Price Points}$$

The table below lists the Offerors’ Price Offers for Base Price, Contract Price, and Life Cycle Costs:

Table 2 – Price Offer Summary and Scores

Offeror	Base Contract		Option Contract		Life Cycle Cost		Total
	Price	Score	Price	Score	Cost	Score	
EMD	260,029,988	21.75	25,945,435.50	2.87	56.75	1.65	26.27
Siemens	225,509,797	25.00	24,834,292.00	3.00	46.68	2.00	30.00
MotivePower	260,909,748	21.67	27,999,759.67	2.66	58.42	1.60	25.93

After review of the Price Offers, the Evaluation Committee concluded that Siemens Industry, Inc. provided the lowest responsive and reasonable overall total price in its Price Offer.

E. Overall Score and Recommendations

An overview of the Responsiveness Scores, Price Scores, and Total Scores are shown in the table below:

Table 3 – Total Offer Scores

Offeror	Responsiveness Score	Price Score	Total Score
EMD	58.11	26.27	84.38
Siemens	64.42	30.00	94.42
MotivePower	58.38	25.93	84.31

Based on the Total Scores shown above, the Evaluation Committee recommends award to Siemens Industry, Inc. as the apparent awardee for the Multi-State Locomotive Procurement.